

Tilburg University

[Review of the book A Gift of Presence. The Theology and Poetry of the Eucharist in Thomas Aquinas, Jan-Heiner Tück (tr. Scott G. Hefelfinger, foreword Bruce D. Marshall, 2018)]

Moons, Jos

Published in:
European Journal for the Study of Thomas Aquinas

Publication date:
2019

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in Tilburg University Research Portal](#)

Citation for published version (APA):
Moons, J. (2019). [Review of the book A Gift of Presence. The Theology and Poetry of the Eucharist in Thomas Aquinas, Jan-Heiner Tück (tr. Scott G. Hefelfinger, foreword Bruce D. Marshall, 2018)]. *European Journal for the Study of Thomas Aquinas*, 37, 81-82.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

turned from a theological textbook for young Dominicans into a philosophical classic. The very fact that except for Jean Porter, all contributors to this collection are philosophers and not theologians, illustrates that the philosophical reading of the *Summa* is still predominant. Although some papers end up with specifically theological topics, these come up only as afterthoughts, never as key questions.

[Harm Goris, Tilburg University]

Jan-Heiner Tück, *A Gift of Presence: The Theology and Poetry of the Eucharist in Thomas Aquinas*, tr. Scott G. Hefelfinger, foreword Bruce D. Marshall (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2018)

In 1923, Pope Pius XI suggested that Thomas Aquinas should be honored with a new title. After praising him for his Eucharistic hymns, in which ‘burns the highest flame of a prayerful soul while they are at the same time a perfect statement of the doctrine of the august sacrament’, he concluded that no one would be surprised about the *cognomen* of the Eucharistic Doctor (see *Studioirem ducem*, no. 23). Half a century later however, Aquinas has largely disappeared from Eucharistic theology and indeed from theology generally. Since the Second Vatican Council, the theological preference has shifted to salvation-historical and hermeneutical approaches, and Eucharistic theology draws on contemporary authors rather than on Aquinas. Moreover, in so far as Aquinas is taken on board, it is usually with a focus on his theology, not on his hymns. In light of these considerations, Jan-Heiner Tück’s reworked *Habilitationsschrift* is highly relevant. Originally published in German in 2009, the book was so well received that in 2014 a third, slightly reworked edition was printed which formed the basis of the English translation. In presenting Aquinas’ theology of the Eucharist (Part A) and suggesting how the conversation between Aquinas and contemporary Eucharistic theology would work out (Part C), Tück gives Aquinas his rightful place; not the neoscholastic, pillar-of-truth-Aquinas, but Aquinas as a major thinker amongst others. In addition, by spending Part B on eucharistic hymns such as *Pange lingua* and *Adoro te*, Tück draws attention to the richness of poetry and prayer as a complement to reflection and theology.

In the first part, Tück focuses on what he calls Aquinas’ Eucharistic theology ‘in its most mature conceptual expression’ in the *Tertia pars* of the *Summa*. An introductory chapter on the *Summa* and on the sacraments is followed by a detailed presentation and commentary of Aquinas’ thinking on Christ’s invisible presence under visible signs. As Tück believes Aquinas’ thoughts is unjustly reduced to transubstantiation, he adds a lengthy and equally detailed third chapter on the Eucharist as representing Christ’s self-gift at the Cross. Thus the Eucharist is indeed a ‘gift of presence’.

The second part broadens this argument with a consideration of *Pange lingua*, *Sacris solemniis*, *Verbum supernum*, *Lauda sion* and *Adoro te*. In each case, Tück moves from the surface of the text – strophic composition, rhyme scheme, rhythm, ... – to what is

possibly best characterized as a theological meditation. New aspects come to the fore, such as the rich diversity of Christ's gift (in *Verbum supernum*) and eschatological desire for unity with God (in *Adoro te*). Finally, Part C brings us back to modern times. After a succinct summary of various 'epochal forms' of Eucharistic theology, Tück suggests how Aquinas' reflections can be meaningful in our time by combining Aquinas and contemporary thinking. This part seems somewhat wandering and less mature than parts A and B.

On various accounts, Tück makes an important contribution to the theology of the Eucharist. His thorough (re)introduction into Aquinas' theology of the Eucharist – the longest part of the book – is all the more valuable for being broadened with a discussion of Aquinas' Eucharistic poetry and being digested for our time. In line with the German tradition of scholarship, Tück has read extensively, with a focus on German literature, however. In spite of the scholastic jargon, the language is fairly accessible.

Finally, as a contribution to the academic discussion, I would like to share two critical considerations. In including poetry and thus broadening his sources beyond the *Summa*, Tück unfortunately has not considered Aquinas' homilies, such as *Homo quidam fecit cenam magnam*. Because in this homily Aquinas draws on Christ's abundance in providing spiritual, sacramental, affective and intellectual nourishment for his people, it would have made Tück more credible in contending that Aquinas' Eucharistic theology stretches beyond transubstantiation. In the second place, I am not sure about Tück's conviction that the Eucharistic hymns are the poetic distillations of his Eucharistic theology. If Aquinas is, indeed, the spiritual person Tück and others believe he is, these hymns do not only poetically concentrate his theology, they also articulate the lived faith that precedes theology. In other words, they not only shed slight on Aquinas' theology, but they also highlight spiritual attitudes befitting the Eucharist, such as reverence or wonder. In addition to proving, once more, that Aquinas' theology is about more than transubstantiation, that would challenge most Eucharistic theologies: spirituality deserves a more central place in theological reflection.

[Jos Moons, KU Leuven/Tilburg University]

Ian Christopher Levy, *Introducing Medieval Biblical Interpretation: The Senses of Scripture in Premodern Exegesis* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2018)

The discussion on the medieval theory of biblical senses initiated in the 20th century by H. de Lubac and B. Smalley provoked a renaissance of studies on medieval exegesis. Thanks to the impressive knowledge of the medieval authors the respect towards pre-modern exegetes is growing despite the "pre-modern" label attached to them. However, many contemporary biblical scholars are not convinced about the need to deal with a period which does not have our historical and critical sensitivity. In this regard, even some strategies of "defending" the value of the medieval exegesis